

༥ །ཇི་བཅུན་སྤྲོ་མ་དམ་པའི་ཞལ་ལུང་རྣམས་བསྐྱེད་བྱུང་ཟིན་གྱིས་སུ་  
བཏབ་པ་སློ་གསལ་དགའ་བའི་རྣ་རྒྱལ།  
དབུ་མ་དང། བྱང་སེམས་ཀྱི་ལམ། སློམ་བཅས་ཀྱི་བཤད་པ།

An Adornment for the Ear to  
Delight Those of Sharp Intelligence:  
Notes to Remember the Sublime Noble  
Master's Oral Instructions

*An Explanation of Madhyamaka,  
the Bodhisattva Path, and Meditation*

Jamyang Khyentse Wangpo



KHYENTSE VISION  
PROJECT

*rje btsun bla ma dam pa'i zhal lung rnams bskyud byang zin bris su btob pa blo gsal dga' ba'i rna rgyan  
dbu ma dang/byang sems kyi lam/sgom bcas kyi bshad pa*

B318.3

Kabum, vol. 2 (kha), 380.1–395.3, Dzongsar 2014.

*Excerpted from:*

B318

Kabum, vol. 2 (kha), 361.1–475.1, Dzongsar 2014.

This text was translated by Shey Rigel under the benevolent supervision of Christian Bernert. Many thanks to Khenpo Tsöndru Zangpo, Do Tulku, and Ngawang Thutop for their kind suggestions. The translation was completed under the patronage of Khyentse Foundation and the supervision of Khyentse Vision Project.

First published 2023

**Khyentse Vision Project:** Translating the collected works of  
Jamyang Khyentse Wangpo

This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/).

# CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	iv
AN EXPLANATION OF MADHYAMAKA, THE BODHISATTVA PATH, AND MEDITATION	1
A Presentation of the Four Great Arguments Upheld by the Mādhyamikas	1
The Assertion of the Great Madhyamaka of Definitive Meaning That All Phenomena Are Subsumed within Three Defining Characteristics	2
The Meaning of the Twenty-Two Divisions in the Bodhisattva's Generation of Bodhicitta Pertaining to the Thresholds	3
Semantic Glosses of the Ten Bodhisattva Grounds	5
How the Five Bodhisattva Paths Are Connected to the Thirty-Seven Qualities	6
Alternating Meditation and the Samādhis of the Nine Absorptions	8
The Manner in Which the Samādhis of the Nine Absorptions—the Concentrations, the Formless, and Cessation—Are Born	9
NOTES	11
BIBLIOGRAPHY	15
GLOSSARY	18

# INTRODUCTION

The following work consists of a short series of notes addressing Madhyamaka reasoning, the three defining characteristics, and topics related to the Mahāyāna path and meditative states. They are drawn from a larger compilation entitled *An Adornment for the Ear to Delight Those of Sharp Intelligence: Notes to Remember the Sublime Noble Master's Oral Instructions*.<sup>1</sup> This work possesses several interesting features, but above all it is important to stress that it is not a formal composition. Rather, it comprises a pastiche largely (if not entirely) based on preexisting sources, with added rearrangements, interpolations (such as topic headings), and omissions. In places where it was not possible to identify a comparable preexisting source, this does not entail the lack of one, as additional research would likely reveal further relevant materials.

While a clear and encompassing relationship between the presentations translated here is not made explicit, they are given as a unit within *An Adornment for the Ear*,<sup>2</sup> and they likely shared a common original location. Furthermore, we do also find notable continuities in their potential sources. Indeed, the initial discussion of Madhyamaka reasoning and the final discussion of the samādhis of the nine absorptions exhibit close correspondences to parts of Jigme Lingpa's (1729/1730–1798) autocommentary to the *Treasury of Precious Qualities*, itself a work of extensive scope. In general, of the plausible sources identified for this extract of *An Adornment for the Ear*, Nyingma works are the most representative.

## Topics and Sources

The first section concerns the four great arguments<sup>3</sup> of the Mādhyamikas. It is extremely similar to the presentation of the four great arguments found in Jigme Lingpa's *Chariot of the Two Realities*,<sup>4</sup> the first part of his autocommentary to the

*Treasury of Precious Qualities*, with some alterations (such as the distribution of headings for the arguments) and omissions (such as citations of sources and parts of the discussion of the “neither singular nor multiple” argument). The presentation of the *Chariot of the Two Realities* itself is very similar to that of Longchenpa’s (1308–1364) *Treasury of Precious Tenet Systems*.<sup>5</sup> Indeed, Jigme Lingpa follows his treatment of the great arguments by stating: “Since such is posited by my guru, who crossed the ocean of our own and others’ tenet systems, refrain from the groundless impudence of claiming ‘there is no presentation of the import of Madhyamaka’s great arguments among the earlier generation of Tibetans.’”<sup>6</sup> Both presentations are situated within discussions of Svātantrika-Madhyamaka.

The second section concerns the three defining characteristics, here discussed with reference to the “Great Madhyamaka of Definitive Meaning.” Khyentse Wangpo’s use of this phrase has at least some resonance with the “Other-Emptiness” Madhyamaka tradition. Intriguingly, however, his presentation closely tracks certain elements of the annotations to a tantra contained within the Derge edition of the Collection of Nyingma Tantras, the *Śrī Herukatanadu*.<sup>7</sup> There is also little within Khyentse Wangpo’s presentation to suggest an archetypal other-emptiness articulation of the three defining characteristics à la Jonang Dolpopa (1292–1361), or one strongly influenced by Śākya Chogden (1428–1507). Although the author of the annotations remains unknown, we might note the figure of Getse Mahāpaṇḍita Tsewang Chogdrub (1761–1829), who was a Nyingma proponent of Other-Emptiness Madhyamaka and also happened to catalog, proof, and arrange the printing of the Derge Collection of Nyingma Tantras; he also composed the aptly named *Ornament to the Sugatagarbha: A Discourse Ascertaining the Approach of the Great Madhyamaka of Definitive Meaning*. It is also worth observing that the divisions that Khyentse Wangpo cites for the three defining characteristics are mirrored by Rongzom Chökyi Zangpo (1042–1136) in one of his own presentations.<sup>8</sup> Finally, despite the clear overlap between Khyentse Wangpo’s presentation and parts of the annotations to the *Śrī Herukatanadu*, we do find at least one significant variant, which could indicate the existence of another source perhaps even predating the annotations themselves.

The third section focuses on the twenty-two divisions in the bodhisattva’s generation of bodhicitta, the resolve set upon supreme awakening (see *Ornament to Clear Realization*, I.19–20).<sup>9</sup> This corresponds essentially verbatim to the same discussion contained in Gampopa’s (1079–1153) *Jewel Ornament of Liberation*.<sup>10</sup> The fourth section provides semantic glosses of the ten bodhisattva grounds. With some differences, principally in the omission of certain fragments, this corresponds to the treatment of the same given in the *Lexicon in Two Volumes*,<sup>11</sup> which is also reproduced

elsewhere in the Kabum in Khyentse Wangpo's own discussion of that work.<sup>12</sup> The fifth section is concerned with the relationship between the five paths of a bodhisattva and the thirty-seven qualities conducive to awakening. In a few places, it corresponds to the *Two Volumes*.

The sixth section does not have a separate topic heading in *An Adornment for the Ear*, but one has been supplied to account for the shift in subject. Its treatment of alternating meditation principally corresponds to a passage in Longchenpa's *White Lotus*,<sup>13</sup> his autocommentary to the *Treasury of Precious Wish-Fulfilling Jewels*. This passage is also repeated in the *Chariot of the Two Realities*.<sup>14</sup> Furthermore, although this section begins with a quotation from the *Mother* (that is, a sūtra of the Prajñāpāramitā cycle), this quote should be considered alongside the seventh section, which is concerned with the development of the samādhis of the nine absorptions. Albeit more essentialized, this discussion is very similar to a corresponding presentation of the nine absorptions in the *Chariot of Omniscience*,<sup>15</sup> the second volume of the autocommentary to the *Treasury of Precious Qualities*. This is itself similar to Longchenpa's presentation of the nine absorptions in his *Great Chariot*,<sup>16</sup> the autocommentary to *Finding Rest in the Nature of Mind*. Both of these presentations cite this particular Prajñāpāramitā quotation in connection with their treatment of the absorptions of the four concentrations. The *Chariot of Omniscience* and the *Great Chariot* each attribute it to the intermediate-length *Mother*; however, a match cannot be found in a search of the Derge Kangyur, and a search of the Buddhist Digital Resource Center only returns instances contained within Nyingma compositions.

Comparison with these varied sources has provided invaluable textual and contextual information and revealed numerous textual discrepancies scattered throughout this excerpt of *An Adornment for the Ear*. While caution is necessary here, I have accordingly allowed variant readings drawn from external sources to influence this translation; the record for this is made available as a supplementary document. In a wider sense, uncovering these textual interconnections represents one of the primary benefits of the study of Khyentse Wangpo's notes—to more precisely understand the kind of source material he was concerned with, the kind of framing and links he drew in their regard, and the broader conceptual world from which his works emerged.

དབུ་མ་དང་། བྱང་སེམས་ཀྱི་ལམ། ལྷོ་མ་བཅས་ཀྱི་བཤད་པ།

## An Explanation of Madhyamaka, the Bodhisattva Path, and Meditation

### **A Presentation of the Four Great Arguments Upheld by the Mādhyamikas**

First, through the vajra splinters argument, the object of refutation is refuted via an analysis of the cause of the object of refutation. The subject, a mere entity, is ultimately something that has not arisen from itself, another, both, or without cause, and as such is empty of all entities that arise. This is analogous, for instance, to a mere object-universal being devoid of entities.

The refutation of arising for the existent and nonexistent is a refutation via analysis of the result of the object of refutation. Because the subject, these dependently arising appearances, is ultimately empty of the following three—the result existing at the time of the cause, not existing, and arising—it is thus empty of any given existent or nonexistent result arising from a cause, and empty of all entities that arise.<sup>17</sup> This is analogous, for instance, to an entity that, despite its absence, is nevertheless illustrated by way of its specific nature.

The refutation of the four possibilities of arising is a refutation via analysis of both cause and result. Appearances as such are ultimately empty of the four possibilities of arising: the arising of a single corresponding result from a single cause, multiple results from a single cause, multiple results from multiple causes, and a single

result from multiple causes. This is analogous, for instance, to applying the designation “space” in the absence of an entity. [381]

The great dependent arising argument is twofold. As to that arranged as an argument of affirming negation—great dependent arising, a refutation via analysis of individual essences—that which dependently arises is free from the eight extremes of arising, cessation, and so forth, and is therefore empty of a real inherent nature. Unimpeded as mere dependent arising, it appears just as, for example, a flickering mirage.

As to that arranged as an argument of nonaffirming negation—the neither singular nor multiple—if we take a given mere existent entity, it is ascertained when by virtue of the simple negation of it being a multiple entity it is found to be singular, that is, it exists as a singular entity. Once it is explicitly determined that a mere existent entity is pervaded by existing as either singular or multiple, this will rule out the possibility of any doubt to the effect that this very existent entity, which is perceived to be what is pervaded by singularity and multiplicity, is not pervaded by its being singular or multiple even were it an ultimate entity. As such, by way of determining the relevant defining properties, there is an implicit establishment of the pervasion of ultimate entities by singularity and multiplicity.<sup>18</sup>

### **The Assertion of the Great Madhyamaka of Definitive Meaning That All Phenomena Are Subsumed within Three Defining Characteristics**

First is the presentation of the imagined. This is identified as those conceptions pertaining to the dual factors of perceived and perceiver, which are persistently imputed by mistaken [382] consciousnesses that conceive the six objects of form and so on and the six sensory faculties—phenomena and individuals—to exist as entities. If we consider its semantic etymology,<sup>19</sup> it is *parisamatādā*,<sup>20</sup> that is, “wholly”—for instance, superimposed in respect to the nonexistent.<sup>21</sup>

The imagined has two divisions: the manifest imagined—the apprehended and apprehender of objects and sensory faculties—and the unmanifest imagined—rabbit horns, the son of a barren woman, what is viewed as a self by non-Buddhists, and the subtle particles upheld by the hearers.

Second is the presentation of the other-dependent. This is identified as simply the all-ground consciousness and its concomitants: minds and mental states that in the manner of causes and results arise for an instant in dependence. Why is it called “other-dependent”? The consciousnesses of sentient beings of the three realms are unable to arise by themselves without relying on other causes and conditions. They are thus known as “other-dependent,” being produced by means of four causes and

conditions. The latent tendencies present within the all-ground are the causal condition; the six collections of engaging faculties—the eye faculty and so on—are the ruling condition; and their objects—such as form, sound, smell, taste, and touch—are the condition of the focal referent. Afforded the opportunity by a previous instant of consciousness having ceased, a subsequent instant arises; the immediately preceding condition is thus. As for the other-dependent’s semantic etymology, it is taught to be *paratantra* because it relies on other conditions and is conscious.<sup>22</sup>

The other-dependent has two divisions: the produced other-dependent is what emerges from the minds of sentient beings, that is, the compounded entities produced by the origin and conditions,<sup>23</sup> [383] and the relative other-dependent consists of the four uncompounded phenomena which are not<sup>24</sup> produced by causes and conditions relative to that. These are comprised of investigative and non-investigative cessations, space, and suchness.

Third is the presentation of the consummate. This is identified as the freedom from the duality of perceived and perceiver in all instances of that which bears that quality, namely, the other-dependent. Why is it called “consummate”? This may be illustrated by water, the sky, and gold.<sup>25</sup> Whether sullied or pellucid, the natural limpid blue of water neither comes from anywhere nor goes anywhere. With respect to gold, too, whether or not it has met with the blows of a smith,<sup>26</sup> its natural golden color neither goes anywhere nor comes from anywhere. And if we take the sky, whether clear or not clear, its pristine nature does not come from anywhere and neither does it go anywhere. Thus it is with the true nature, the expanse of reality—if the Buddha has taught about it in this world, it does not come from anywhere, and if he has not, nowhere does it go.

As for its semantic etymology, it is *pariniṣpanna*, for suchness and authentic primordial wisdom, in an unchanging and unmistakable manner, are fully complete and actualized. Thus, they are consummate [384] defining characteristics. It has two divisions: the unchanging consummate, which is the true nature of phenomena, and the unmistakable consummate, the primordial wisdom of awareness that realizes the true nature without error.

Here, too, we can say that all imputations that a nonexistent entity exists are imagined; all things that arise by way of causes and conditions are other-dependent; and everything neither imputed by a mistaken mind nor produced by causes and conditions is the consummate.

### **The Meaning of the Twenty-Two Divisions in the Bodhisattva’s Generation of Bodhicitta Pertaining to the Thresholds**

The *Ornament to Clear Realization* states:

Earth, gold, moon, and fire,  
Treasure, jewel mine, and ocean,  
Vajra, mountain, medicine, and spiritual companion,  
Wish-fulfilling gem, sun, and song;

King, treasury, and highway,  
Steed and spring,  
And mellifluous sound, river, and cloud—  
With these, it is also of twenty-two kinds.<sup>27</sup>

The referents of these twenty-two analogies extend from the intent to achieve the goal to the dharmakāya, and may be connected to the five paths. (1) The generation of bodhicitta possessed of intent resembles the earth, for it forms the ground for all pure deeds; (2) that which is possessed of resolve resembles gold, for until awakening it will not change; and (3) that which is possessed of surpassing resolve is akin to the waxing moon, for all virtuous practices will flourish. [385] These three are included within the ground of the beginner—the lesser, middling, and greater paths of accumulation. (4) That which is possessed of application is akin to fire, for it burns away the tinder obscuring the three forms of omniscience. This is included within the path of joining. (5) That which is possessed of the perfection of generosity is like a great treasure, for it makes all sentient beings content.

That which is possessed of ethical discipline is like a mine of precious jewels, for it functions as the support for the precious jewels of excellent qualities. That which is possessed of forbearance is like a great ocean, for it is undisturbed should anything undesirable come to pass. That which is possessed of diligence is like a vajra, for in its indestructibility it stands firm. That which is possessed of concentration is like the king of mountains, for it is unmoved by the distraction of a focal referent. That which is possessed of wisdom is like medicine, for it pacifies the sicknesses of afflictions. That which is possessed of skillful means is like a virtuous spiritual companion, for the welfare of beings is not forsaken under any circumstances. That which is possessed of aspiration is like a wish-fulfilling gem, for results will be achieved precisely as one aspires. That which is possessed of strength is like the sun, for it fully ripens disciples. That which is possessed of the perfection of primordial wisdom [386] is likened to tones of Dharma, for it teaches the Dharma that inspires disciples. Accordingly, these ten are respectively subsumed within the ten grounds of the bodhisattva, elation and so on, and fall within the purview of the path of seeing and the path of cultivation.

That which is possessed of supernormal awareness is like a great king, for with irresistible power it accomplishes the benefit of others. That which is possessed of merit and primordial wisdom is like a treasury, for it is a storehouse rich in accumulations. That which is possessed of the qualities conducive to awakening is like a highway, for it has been traveled, and will yet again be traveled, by all noble ones. That which is possessed of compassion and special insight is like a steed, for one advances with ease, not falling into either saṃsāra or nirvāṇa. That which is possessed of recollection and eloquence resembles a spring, for in its retention of the Dharma, heard and unheard, it is inexhaustible. These five are thus subsumed within the special path of the bodhisattvas.

That which is possessed of a pleasure grove of Dharma is like the hearing of a mellifluous sound, for it resounds so delightfully for disciples seeking liberation. That which is possessed of the singular path of traveling is like the flow of a river, for in its activities to benefit others it remains undiminished. That which is possessed of the dharmakāya resembles a cloud, for activities to benefit beings—through such displays as residing in Tuṣita [387] and so on—depend upon it.<sup>28</sup> Accordingly, these three are included within the ground of buddhahood. Thus, starting from the ground of the beginner all the way up to the ground of buddhahood, all twenty-two are subsumed.

Additionally, there are four divisions in terms of the thresholds: the generation of bodhicitta possessed of conviction, that possessed of surpassing resolve, that of maturation, and that of abandoning obscurations. The first is included within the ground of practice through conviction. The second ranges from the first to the seventh grounds. The third ranges from the eighth to the tenth grounds. The fourth is the ground of buddhahood. Accordingly, these are also mentioned in the *Ornament to the Mahāyāna Sūtras*:

Regarding that generation of bodhicitta, with reference to the grounds,  
 There is that of conviction, pure surpassing resolve,  
 And maturation, which is held to be distinct;  
 Likewise, there is that of abandoning obscurations.<sup>29</sup>

### **Semantic Glosses of the Ten Bodhisattva Grounds**

Because one draws near to awakening and perceives the achievement of manifold beings' welfare, there is "elation."<sup>30</sup> Having purified up to even subtle downfalls, one is "unstained" by corrupted ethical discipline. Because one attains an utterly pure aggregate of samādhi transcending the grounds of the hearers and self-realized buddhas, the transformation associated with the great light of primordial wisdom, there is "illumination." Radiating the flames of the factors conducive to awakening, [388]

which burn away the afflictions, there is “radiance.” Cultivation of the four truths of the noble ones, surpassing that of the hearers and self-realized buddhas, and refinement and cultivation of what is completely purified, wisdom which does not dwell in either saṃsāra or nirvāṇa, are “exquisitely difficult.”<sup>31</sup>

Based on the perfection of wisdom, one abides extensively in and perceives directly manifest primordial wisdom that does not abide in either saṃsāra or nirvāṇa and naturally penetrates the absence of characteristics. Thus, there is “manifestation.” Advancing far by having drawn close to the singular path that proceeds to the absence of characteristics, one is “far traveled.” Unable to be shaken by the distinguishing cognitions of either the existence or nonexistence of characteristics, one is “immovable.” Having attained the correct knowledges, one’s intellect is exalted above that of others. Thus, there is “excellent intelligence.” All dhāraṇīs and samādhis pervade the heard Dharma, like a cloud pervading the sky.<sup>32</sup> Thus, there is a “cloud of Dharma.” These grounds are connected to the whole set of the ten perfections: generosity, ethical discipline, forbearance, diligence, concentration, wisdom, skillful means, aspiration, strength, and primordial wisdom.

### **How the Five Bodhisattva Paths Are Connected to the Thirty-Seven Qualities**

Since they are oriented toward the three forms of awakening,<sup>33</sup> from the applications of mindfulness to the eightfold path of the noble ones, there are the thirty-seven qualities for awakening. In this regard, specific and general characteristics<sup>34</sup> [389] are investigated with wisdom, and witnessed objects are grasped with clarity by means of mindfulness. Since it is mindfulness that predominates, these are the four applications of mindfulness. Mindfulness of the body contemplates the objects of impermanence, suffering, and absence of self; mindfulness of sensations contemplates pleasant, unpleasant, and neutral sensations; mindfulness of the mind contemplates the eight collections of consciousness; and mindfulness of phenomena examines the objects of the afflicted and purified.

With diligence, virtue is generated and nonvirtue is abandoned. Thus, there are four right exertions: the abandonment of nonvirtue that has arisen within the three gateways; not generating that which has yet to arise; the further enhancement of virtuous practices that have arisen within the three gateways; and the generation of those which have yet to arise. Due to being the cause and support for supernormal abilities, such as traveling through the sky, the four foundations of supernormal ability are named as such. Through intent, a fierce intent is roused; through diligence, one is swift in accomplishment; through volition, whatever is wished for is achieved;

and through analysis, whatever result is enjoyed. The “path of accumulation” is named as such due to its gathering of bountiful accumulations.

One exerts power over the generation of virtues conducive to liberation within the mental continuum of a mind rendered malleable through the power of the five-fold grouping of faith and so on. For this reason, there are five powers; one obtains power over faith, diligence, mindfulness, samādhi, and wisdom. Through prolonged cultivation of these five powers, the following five—lack of faith, [390] laziness, impaired mindfulness, distraction, and inattentiveness—will be unable to form obstacles. Thus, there are five strengths that generate the capacities of faith and so on. The “path of joining” is named as such because via heat, peak, forbearance, and the supreme quality one joins with the path of seeing. The apprehended object’s lack of intrinsic nature constitutes heat, for it is held to burn away the tinder of afflictions through the path of the noble ones. With confidence in this, it forms the peak of the roots of virtue, and thus it is the peak. There is forbearance of the apprehender lacking intrinsic nature and forbearance of contaminated arising and perishing. With confidence in this, one thus attains to the supreme quality, which is superior to other worldly qualities.

Because reality becomes a cause for awakening on the path of seeing, it consists of seven branches of awakening. Here, there is the branch of awakening of right mindfulness, which does not forget its focal referent; the branch of awakening of the discernment of phenomena, as they are and in their multiplicity; the branch of awakening of diligence to go beyond saṃsāra; the branch of awakening of joy, which serves the welfare of body, speech, and mind; the branch of awakening of pliancy, which consists of mental malleability; the branch of awakening of samādhi, where the mind rests evenly upon a single point, free from grasping; and the branch of awakening of equanimity, which is accompanied by the attainment of a joy that is free from hope and fear in respect of all things. The “path of seeing” [391] is named as such because what was previously unseen is seen.

The eightfold path of the noble ones brings forth the attainment of the result of an arhat. With right view, the path of seeing is made manifest; with right thought, one does not speak without understanding; with right speech, one teaches the Dharma to those whom it will tame; with right action, one does not act otherwise, engaging in improper deeds; with right livelihood, one does no harm either to oneself or to others, and is untainted by afflictions; with right effort, one accomplishes uncompounded phenomena; with right mindfulness, the nonvirtues of minds and mental states will find no opportunity; with right samādhi, one knows all things with the primordial wisdom possessed of an instant of mind, and it is through such primor-

dial wisdom that one is fully awakened. The “path of cultivation” is named as such because it involves repeatedly familiarizing oneself with the true nature of reality.

If connected to the ten grounds, the first is the path of seeing, and the second through the eighth are the path of cultivation. From practice through conviction to the first ground, outside of accomplishing one’s own benefit one is unable to effect the benefit of others, for one is oneself not free of afflictions. From the second to the eighth ground, the benefit of both is carried out, for one is free from manifest afflictions, though they persist in latency. From the ninth to the tenth, one exclusively acts for the benefit of others. [392] Indeed, since the afflictions as well as their seeds are discarded, there is no need to act for one’s own benefit. The ninth and tenth grounds form the path of no further training, for they are explained to dispense with the phase of the path of training.<sup>35</sup>

### **Alternating Meditation and the Samādhis of the Nine**

#### **Absorptions**

In the *Mother*,<sup>36</sup> we find the following:

Accompanied by conceptualization and analysis<sup>37</sup> is the first concentration. Without conceptualization but with analysis alone is the second concentration. Mental engagement with neither conceptualization nor analysis is the third concentration. Mental engagement of joy and withdrawal is the fourth concentration.

Regarding the fourth concentration, if by alternating the uncontaminated wisdom of the noble ones one meditates in five stages, one will take birth in the five pure abodes, Avṛha and so on. Here, alternating<sup>38</sup> the first concentration and the fourth is lesser; alternating the fourth based on the combination of the first and second is middling; alternating the three of the first, second, and third, with the fourth is great; alternating each subdivision of the four concentrations and the fourth is immensely great; and to perform a skipped meditation in regard to those is supremely great. With respect to skipping, it is done by means of meditating on the fourth, from eschewing some of the four concentrations to leaping over them. Proceeding in ascending order, sequentially and nonsequentially, dispensing with one to three, to discarding in descending order, one meditates on the fourth.

Whether understanding or experience, either case constitutes the concentration of an ordinary being’s meditation. [393] From the perspective of one who proceeds sequentially, beginning with the approaches to watching the natural state of the mind, this consists of greater one-pointedness and below. The nonconceptual wisdom of

the noble ones is precisely that special insight that understands the nine absorptions to be without an inherent nature.

### **The Manner in Which the Samādhis of the Nine Absorptions— the Concentrations, the Formless, and Cessation—Are Born**

The training of the first concentration is accompanied by a conceptualizing cognition, which instigates settling in equipoise, along with a watchful analysis of the empty luminosity wherein one rests without conceptualizing that in any way whatsoever. Through this, the actualization, which is nonconceptual, is born, while post-session intervals are accompanied by conceptualization and analysis. This is the samādhi of the first concentration. From its pellucid aspect dawns, to a small extent, the exalted eyes and supernormal awareness.

Next, the training is the preparatory stage of the stable actualization of that previous mind, which is without conceptualization but accompanied by analysis alone. Absent even a subtle thought that cognizes that too as empty luminosity but accompanied by an experiential apprehension, a luminous yet nonconceptual state is born. This is the actualization, which constitutes the samādhi of the second concentration.

Then, from the preparatory stage consisting of the stable actualization of that mind is born a special nonconceptuality that is absent of either conceptualization or analysis. This is the actualization that comprises the samādhi of the third concentration.

Finally, the preparatory stage of the fourth concentration again consists of the stable actualization of the prior concentration. Compared to the previous joy and bliss derived from bliss, clarity, and nonconceptuality, [394] from this is born a joy and bliss that are far surpassing. This is the actualization of the fourth concentration.

Moreover, for each of these, the stages in their approaches to familiarization form the cause for birth within three respective heavenly abodes in the form realm. These are the twelve abodes of ordinary beings: Bṛhatphala and below.

Bṛhatphala's very nature of joy and bliss may stray into mere calm abiding without attaining the radiance of deep luminosity. Should this happen, with the stream of sensory objects having ceased, the pellucid aspect of both the conceptual and nonconceptual will cease, and one will be impelled into the formless realm. There, consciousness whose luminous aspect has abated becomes familiarized with a spacelike, merely empty yet unimpeded nature. This is the sphere of boundless space. Through becoming accustomed to that state, though one places one's attention upon the boundless vivid appearance of mind alone from the perspective of consciousness, the cessation of the pellucid aspect of the six collections is stabilized. Through this,

there is boundless consciousness. By familiarizing oneself accordingly, with even the subtle sensation of cognizing as mind alone having dissipated, one does not perceive there to be anything at all. This is the mind of nothingness. And in the same fashion, to abide within a dense nonconceptuality wherein one's attention is placed upon the fact that even the mind that apprehends as nothingness is neither existent nor non-existent, this is the sphere of neither existent nor non-existent. This mind constitutes the peak of existence. Whichever of these one becomes accustomed to, having passed away within that state, one will be reborn there.

As to cessation, by the halting of pleasant and unpleasant sensations, [395] as well as distinguishing cognitions, the samādhi of cessation is attained. Here, the fifty mental states and eightyfold host of thoughts and so on are permanently brought to cessation, and in that thick darkness the excellent qualities of its aspect of awareness lie dormant. Additionally, there is cessation via investigation by mental analysis and non-investigative cessation, wherein one rests within a nonconceptual state.

The concentrations of Bṛhatphala and below are made manifest as mere steps along the path of wisdom, but to be liberated, having embraced their very appearance with authentic, nonconceptual special insight, is a distinction of the noble ones.

## NOTES

1. *rje btsun bla ma dam pa'i zhal lung rnams bskyud byang zin bris su btab pa blo gsal dga' ba'i rna rgyan* (Kabum, vol. 2, 361–475).
2. The individual sections compiled in the *Adornment* are delimited by the “snake stroke,” or *sbrul shad* (ལྗོ); this falls only at the beginning and end of this extract.
3. These are also often given as five.
4. *bden gnyis shing rta*, Kazi, 844–46.
5. *grub mtha' rin po che'i mdzod*, 43b–44b.
6. *zhes bdag gi bla ma rang gzhan gi grub mtha' rgya mtsho'i pha rol tu son pa de bzbed pas dbu ma'i gtan tshigs chen po'i go don bod snga rabs la 'chad rgyu med cas spyi brtol bskyed par mi bya'o* (*bden gnyis shing rta*, Kazi, 846).
7. *dpal kbrag 'thung gal po*, 18.6–22.1.
8. Almogi, “Yogācāra in the Writings of Rong zom Chos kyi bzang po,” 1355.
9. See Wangchuk, *The Resolve to Become a Buddha*, 273–74: “The *loci classici* setting forth the twenty-twofold classification of *cittotpāda* are *Mahāyānasūtrālamkāra* 4.15–20 and *Abhisamayālamkāra* 1.19–20. It may, however, be assumed that the key terms of the twenty-two types of *cittotpāda* were compiled from earlier Mahāyāna sources. In fact, the *Abhisamayālamkāra* explicitly states that *cittotpāda* is presented in it, both in short and in detail, in accordance with the sūtras. Haribhadra identifies the *Pañcaviṃśatisāhasrikā* as the source of this classification. Likewise, Abhayākara Gupta states in his *Munimatālamkāra* that the twenty-twofold classification has been taught in the *Śatasāhasrikā* and the *Pañcaviṃśatisāhasrikā*.”
10. *thar pa rin po che'i rgyan*, 360–63.

11. *sgra sbyor bam po gnyis pa*, 277–78. Toh. 4347.
12. *sgra sbyor bam po gnyis pa sogs rig gnas che chung gi ’bel gtam, mkhyen brtse’i dbang po’i bka’bum*, vol. 17, 136–37.
13. *padma dkar po*, 26a–26b.
14. *bden gnyis shing rta*, Kazi, 41.
15. *rnam mkhyen shing rta*, Kazi, 729–35.
16. *shing rta chen po*, 288a–99b.
17. There is some difficulty here in interpreting the sense of “three” (*gsum ka*) in “empty of the following three—the result existing at the time of the cause, not existing, and arising” (*’bras bu la yod med skye ba gsum ka stong*) (*Adornment*, 380). A more usual reading might consist of something like “empty of the arising of existent and nonexistent results at the time of the cause” but this does not take into account a third element in *yod med skye ba gsum ka*. This mention of a group of three in the context of the negation of arising for the existent and nonexistent is found not only in the *bden gnyis shing rta* (Kazi, 845) (the primary source for this section), but the *legs bshad gser gyi thur ma*, 302, as well, a “difficult points” (*dka’gnad*) commentary to the *yon tan rin po che’i mdzod*. However, it is not found in Yönten Gyatso’s (dge mang mkhan chen yon tan rgya mtsho, nineteenth century) commentary to the *bden gnyis shing rta (zla ba’i sgron me*, 708), which simply has “the arising of both existent and nonexistent resultant entities” (*’bras bu’i dngos po yod pa dang med pa gnyis ka skye ba*). And while *legs bshad gser gyi thur ma* mentions three elements, it only provides the rationale for refuting the arising of existent and nonexistent results at the time of the cause. Longchenpa’s *grub mtha’ rin po che’i mdzod*, 43b, which the *bden gnyis shing rta* presentation is clearly based on, is slightly different and does not explicitly mention three elements. We do, however, find further support for “arising” (*skye ba*) as taken separately in the phrase: “empty of the result existing at the time of the cause, not existing, and arising” (*rgyu la ’bras bu yod pa dang med pa dang skye bas stong pa*), here with an extra *dang* (“and”) clearly demarcating *skye ba*. According to the *bla rung slob gling* digital edition of the *grub mtha’ rin po che’i mdzod*, 331, the *dang* preceding *skye ba* is missing in an edition from Dzogchen Monastery (rdzogs chen dgon), but it is present in the other editions consulted.
18. This highly dense and technical passage is a partial representation of only the third section of Longchenpa’s treatment of the neither singular nor multiple argument in *grub mtha’ rin po che’i mdzod*, 44a–44b, concerned with the valid cognition which determines the pervasion (*khyab pa nges byed kyi tshad ma*). That said, the *Adornment* is clearly based on the reproduction of the *grub mtha’ rin po che’i mdzod* presentation in the *bden gnyis shing rta* (Kazi, 846), sharing certain characteristic variations. For a fuller picture the reader should consult the entire presentation contained in the *grub mtha’ rin po che’i mdzod*, which also treats, for instance, “laying out the argument” (*gtan tshigs ’god pa*), where we find: “Anything pervaded by being neither singular nor multiple is pervaded by being empty of a real entity” (*gang gcig dang du ma dang bral bas khyab pa de bden pa’i dngos pos stong pas khyab*) as well as specific mention of “neither ultimate singularity nor multiplicity” (*don dam pa’i gcig dang du ma dang bral ba*).
19. While not easily transposed into English, *nges tshig (nirukta, nirukti)* is rendered here as “semantic etymology” based on Bronkhorst’s distinction between semantic and historical etymologies: “A semantic etymology is to be distinguished from a historical etymology. A historical etymology presents the origin or early history of a word; it tells us, for example, that a word in a modern language is derived from another word be-

longing to an earlier language, or to an earlier stage of the same language. The English word *militant*, for example, is derived from Latin *militans* through the intermediary of French *militant*. And the Hindi pronoun *main*, ‘I,’ is derived from Sanskrit *mayā* through Prakrit *mae* (Oberlies, 1998: 17). Semantic etymologies do something different. They connect one word with one or more others which are believed to elucidate its meaning. The god Rudra, for example, has that name according to the Vedic text called *Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa* (6.1.3.10), because he cried (*rud-*) in one story that is told about him” (Bronkhorst, *Etymology and Magic*, 147).

20. For *parisamatādā* I have reproduced what we find in the source text, but there are variants. For instance, *dpal khrag ’thung gal po*, 19, has *parisamatād* and the *sgra sbyor bam po gnyis pa* (*sde dge*, 302) has *parisamatād*.
21. What we have here appears to be an incomplete reproduction of the semantic etymology found in the annotations to *dpal khrag ’thung gal po* and *sgra sbyor bam po gnyis pa*. If expanded with interpolations supplied from *dpal thrag ’thung gal po*, 19, we have: “[*parikalpītalakṣaṇa* is the imagined defining characteristic]. It is *parisamatād*, that is, wholly [or thoroughly, and *kalpita*,] for instance, [conceived or] superimposed in respect to the nonexistent.” *sgra sbyor bam po gnyis pa*, 302, contains a slightly different reading: instead of *med pa la brtags pa’am sgro btags pa*, we have *med pa’am sgro btags pa* (*sgra sbyor bam po gnyis pa*, 302), shifting the translation to “[...and *kalpita*,] for instance, nonexistent or superimposed.”
22. The second part of this semantic etymology (*shes pas der ston*) is wholly distinct from the corresponding part of the semantic etymology in *dpal khrag ’thung gal po*, 20, and *sgra sbyor bam po gnyis pa*, 302.
23. We might observe here that of the four aspects of the truth of origin (*kun ’byung bden pa’i rnam pa bzhi*), the second and fourth are the origin (*kun ’byung*) and conditions (*rkyen*), respectively.
24. Strictly speaking, the *Adornment*, 383, has *rgyu rkyen las bskyed pa’i ’dus ma byas bzhi* or “the four uncompounded phenomena that are produced from causes and conditions,” but this is implausible as a reading.
25. These examples are found in *Madhyāntavibhāga* I.16.
26. *dpal khrag ’thung gal po*, 19, has *mgar bas byas rung ma byas rung* (“whether fashioned or not by a goldsmith”).
27. *Ornament to Clear Realization* I.19–20.
28. They depend on the dharmakāya just as crops and so forth depend on the rain brought by clouds.
29. *Ornament to the Mahāyāna Sūtras* IV.2.
30. This refers to the first bodhisattva ground. The others follow below.
31. The full name of this ground—“exquisitely difficult to conquer” (*shin tu sbyang dka’ ba*)—is not given here; *sgra sbyor bam po gnyis pa*, 277, adds this to its more extensive gloss.
32. This gloss of the tenth ground, “cloud of Dharma,” appears to be based on *Mahāyānasūtrālamkāra* XX.34. The original (found almost identically in *sgra sbyor bam po gnyis pa*, 278.3) is possibly corrupted, repeating the comparison with clouds and the verb “pervade” (*khyab*); this repetition has been left out of the translation which in its full form might be rendered: “All dhāraṇīs and samādhis pervade like a cloud, and heard Dharma, akin to the sky, like a cloud they pervade” (*gzungs dang*

*ting 'dzin kun la yang sprin dang 'dra bar khyab cing/ thos pa'i chos nam mkeba' 'dra ba la sprin bzbin khyab pas chos kyi sprin no/* (388.4–5). Note also that Tibetan translations of *Sūtrālamkāravākyā* 510.5 have *thob pa'i chos* rather than *thos pa'i chos* (found in both in the *Adornment* and the *sgra sbyor bam po gnyis pa*) in its gloss of *Mahāyānasūtrālamkāra* XX.34. This would read “obtained Dharma,” or even “attained qualities,” instead of “heard Dharma.”

33. The three forms of awakening refer to the awakening of the hearer, self-realized buddha, and bodhisattva.
34. According to *sgra sbyor bam po gnyis pa*, 290, these are the special and general characteristics of the body, mind, sensations, and phenomena.
35. This is a rather unusual explanation of the path of no further training, which is generally identified with the level of buddhahood. It may be a case of ascribing the name of the result to the cause (*'bras ming rgyu la btags pa*). Furthermore, *slob lam gyis gnas* skabs, 392.1, is being read as *slob lam gyi gnas skabs* here; the original would be something like “...for they are explained to dispense with the phases through the path of training.”
36. That is, the Prajñāpāramitā sūtras. See Introduction.
37. The word “conceptualization” (*rtog pa*) can carry a specific sense in this context as counterpart to analysis (*dpyod pa*). Lati Rinpoche et al., *Meditative States in Tibetan Buddhism*, 167, explain the term (here rendered “investigation”): “Furthermore, [with regard to the entry into these] the investigation that is a branch of the first concentration is a mental factor that engages its object in a coarse manner, and analysis is a mental factor that engages its object in a fine manner.” The text continues with commentary by Denma Lochö Rinpoche, “If ground wheat sticks to our fingers, we say that it is coarse, whereas the flour we normally use is finely ground. Similarly, in investigation, the mind investigates its object ‘in a coarse manner’ – not in detail but roughly. This use of the Tibetan word *rtog pa* to mean ‘investigation’ (*vitarka*) should not be confused with the usual usage of the words *rtog pa* and *rtog med* to mean ‘conceptual’ (*kalpaka*) and ‘non-conceptual’ (*nirvikalpaka*), respectively. Analysis ‘engages its object in a fine manner’ – that is, in detail – because that which is settled in a coarse manner by investigation is gone into more subtly by analysis.”
38. From here to the end of the paragraph, the Tibetan almost exactly corresponds to Longchenpa’s *padma dkar po*, 26a–26b. This passage is also repeated in *bden gnyis shing rta* (Kazi, 41), with some variant readings.

# BIBLIOGRAPHY

## Source Text Editions

- Jamyang Khyentse Wangpo. *rje btsun bla ma dam pa'i zbal lung rnams bskyud byang zin bris su btab pa blo gsal dga' ba'i rna rgyan*. In *mkhyen brtse'i dbang po'i bka' 'bum*, vol. 10, 56b–67a. Dzongsar: rdzong sar dgon pa'i par khang, 1919.
- Jamyang Khyentse Wangpo. *rje btsun bla ma dam pa'i zbal lung rnams bskyud byang zin bris su btab pa blo gsal dga' ba'i rna rgyan*. In *mkhyen brtse'i dbang po'i bka' 'bum*, vol. 2, 372–489. Gangtok: Gonpo Tseten, 1977–1980.
- Jamyang Khyentse Wangpo. *sgra sbyor bam po gnyis pa sogs rig gnas che chung gi 'bel gtam*. In *mkhyen brtse'i dbang po'i bka' 'bum*, vol. 17, 119–40. Dzongsar: rdzong sar blo gros phun tshogs, 2014.

## Tengyur Sources

- Madhyavyutpattih* (*sgra sbyor bam po gnyis pa*). Toh. 4347.
- Maitreya. *Abhisamayālamkāra* (*mngon par rtogs pa'i rgyan*). Toh. 3786.
- Maitreya. *Mahāyānasūtrālamkāra* (*theg pa chen po mdo sde'i rgyan*). Toh. 4020.
- Vasubandhu. *Abhidharmakośa* (*chos mngon pa mdzod*). Toh. 4089.
- Vasubandhu. *Sūtrālamkāravākyā* (*mdo sde'i rgyan gyi bshad pa*). Toh. 4026.

## Collection of Nyingma Tantras (*rnying ma rgyud 'bum*) Sources

- Śrī Herukatanadu* (*dpal khrag 'thung gal po*). In *rnying ma rgyud 'bum* (*sde dge par ma*), vol. 19, 1a–219b. Derge: sde dge par khang chen mo.
- Śrī Herukatanadu* (*dpal khrag 'thung gal po che*). In *rnying ma rgyud 'bum* (*gting skyes*), vol. 25, 119–337. Thimphu: Dingo Khyentse Rimpoche, 1975.
- Śrī Herukatanatu* (*dpal khrag 'thung gal po che*). In *rnying ma rgyud 'bum* (*mtshams brag dgon pa'i bris ma*), vol. 33, 223–492. Thimphu: National Library, Royal Government of Bhutan, 1982.

## Tibetan Sources

- Gampopa (sgam po pa bsod nams rin chen). *dam chos yid bzhin nor bu thar pa rin po che'i rgyan*. In *'bri gung bka' brgyud chos mdzod chen mo*, vol. 11, 273–505. Lhasa: 'bri gung mthil dgon, 2004.
- Jigme Lingpa ('jigs med gling pa). In *The Collected Works of 'Jigs-med-glin-pa Rai-byun-rdo-rje Mkhyen-brtse'i-'od-zer, 1730–1798 (sde dge par ma)*, vol. 2, 1–880. Gangtok: Pema Thinley for Dodrupchen Rinpoche, 1985.
- Jigme Lingpa. *yon tan rin po che'i mdzod kyi rgya cher 'grel pa bden gnyis shing rta*. In *kun mkhyen 'jigs med gling pa'i gsung 'bum*, vol.1, 1–925. Gangtok: Sonam T. Kazi, 1970–1975.
- Jigme Lingpa. *yon tan rin po che'i mdzod kyi rgya cher 'grel pa bden gnyis shing rta*. In *The Collected Works of 'Jigs-med-glin-pa Rai-byun-rdo-rje Mkhyen-brtse'i-'od-zer, 1730–1798 (sde dge par ma)*, vol. 1, 103–1023. Gangtok: Pema Thinley for Dodrupchen Rinpoche, 1985.
- Jigme Lingpa. *yon tan rin po che'i mdzod las bras bu'i theg pa'i rgya cher 'grel rnam mkhyen shing rta*. In *kun mkhyen 'jigs med gling pa'i gsung 'bum*, vol. 2, 1–877. Gangtok: Sonam T. Kazi, 1970–1975.
- Khenpo Nüden (nus ldan mkhyen brtse'i blo gros). *mkhas pa'i tshul la 'jug pa'i sgo'i mchan 'grel legs bshad snang ba'i 'od zer*. In *zhe chen rgyal tshab kyi bka' 'bum*, vol. 11, 1–719. Paro: Ngodup, 1975–1994.
- Lochen Dharmasrī (lo chen dhar+ma shrI). *dpal gsang ba'i snying po de kbo nyid nges pa'i rgyud kyi rgyal po sgyu 'phrul drwa ba spyi don gyi sgo nas gtan la 'bebs par byed pa'i legs bshad gsang bdag zhal lung*. In *Collected Works (gsung 'bum) of Smin-glin Lochen Dharmasrī*, vol.7, 2–841. Dehra Dun: D.g. Khochen Trulku, 1975–1977.
- Longchen Rabjam (klong chen rab 'byams pa dri med 'od zer). *rdzogs pa chen po sems nyid ngal gso'i 'grel pa shing rta chen po*. In *gsung 'bum (sde dge par ma)*, vol. 4, 1a–350a. Derge: sde dge par khang chen mo, 2000.
- Longchen Rabjam. *theg pa chen po'i men ngag gi bstan bcos yid bzhin rin po che'i mdzod*. In *klong chen rab 'byams pa dri med 'od zer gyi gsung 'bum (sde dge par ma)*, vol. 1, 1–61. Derge: sde dge par khang chen mo, 2000.
- Longchen Rabjam. *theg pa chen po'i man ngag gi bstan bcos yid bzhin rin po che'i mdzod kyi 'grel pa padma dkar po*. In *gsung 'bum (sde dge par ma)*, vol. 1, 64–624. Derge: sde dge par khang chen mo, 2000.
- Longchen Rabjam. *theg pa mtha' dag gi don gsal bar byed pa grub pa'i mtha'i rin po che'i mdzod*. In *gsung 'bum (sde dge par ma)*, vol. 2, 1a–448a. Derge: sde dge par khang chen mo, 2000.
- Longchen Rabjam. *theg pa mtha' dag gi don gsal bar byed pa grub pa'i mtha'i rin po che'i mdzod*. gser rta rdzong: gser thang bla rung lnga rig nang bstan slob gling, n.d.
- Ngagwang Tendar (a lag sha ngag dbang bstan dar). *yon tan rin po che'i mdzod kyi dka' gnad rdo rje'i rgya mdud 'gro byed legs bshad gser gyi thur ma*. Paro: Ngodrup and Sherab Drimay, 1978.

- Pema Karpo (padma dkar po). *sems dpa' chen po padma dkar po'i rnam thar thugs rje chen po'i zlos gar*. In *The Collected Works of Kun-mkhyen Padma dkar-po*, vol. 3, 330–597. Darjeeling: Kargyud Sungrab Nyamso Khang, 1973.
- Rongtön (rong ston shes bya kun rig). *mdo sde rgyan gyi rnam bshad theg chen gsal bar byed pa'i gnad kyī sgron me*. In *kun mkhyen rong ston chen po'i bka' 'bum*, vol.7, 11–533. skye dgu mdo: gangs ljongs rig rgyan gsung rab par khang, 2004.
- Rongtön. *mngon rtogs rgyan gyi 'grel pa'i rnam bshad tshig don rab gsal*. In *bka' 'bum*, vol. 3, 1–772. skye dgu mdo: gangs ljongs rig rgyan gsung rab par khang, 2004.
- Śākya Chogden (gser mdog paN chen shAkya mchog ldan). *shes rab kyī pha rol tu phyin pa'i man ngag gi bstan bcos mngon par rtogs pa'i rgyan 'grel pa dang bcas pa'i dka' ba'i gnas rnam rnam par bshad nas rang gzhan gyi grub pa'i mtha' rnam par dbye ba lung rigs kyī rol mtsho, smad cha*. In *The Complete Works (gsung 'bum) of Gser-mdog Pañ-chen Śākya-mchog-ldan*, vol. 2, 1–469. New Delhi: Ngawang Topgyal, 1995.
- Yönten Gyatso (dge mang mkhan chen yon tan rgya mtsho). *yon tan rin po che'i mdzod kyī 'grel pa bden gnyis gsal byed zla ba'i sgron me*. Gangtok: Sonam T. Kazi, 1969.

## Secondary References

- Almogi, Orna. “Yogācāra in the Writings of the Eleventh-Century Rnying ma Scholar Rong zom Chos kyī bzang po.” *Foundation for Yoga Practitioners: The Buddhist Yogācārabhūmi Treatise and Its Adaptation in India, East Asia, and Tibet*, n.d., 1330–61.
- Bronkhorst, Johannes. “Etymology and Magic: Yāska’s Nirukta, Plato’s Cratylus, and the Riddle of Semantic Etymologies.” *Numen* 48, no. 2 (2001): 147–203.
- Brunnhözl, Karl. *Gone Beyond: The Prajñāpāramitā Sūtras, The Ornament of Clear Realization, and Its Commentaries in the Tibetan Kagyü Tradition*. Volumes 1 and 2. Ithaca, NY: Snow Lion Publications, 2010 & 2012.
- Gampopa. *The Jewel Ornament of Liberation: The Wish-Fulfilling Gem of the Noble Teachings*. Edited by Ani K. Chodron. Translated by Khenpo Konchog Gyaltsen Rinpoche. Ithaca, NY: Snow Lion Publications, 1998.
- Forgues, Gregory. *Unraveling the Intent: Saṃdhinirmocana*. v 1.0.0. 84000.co, 2020. <https://read.84000.co/translation/toh106.html>.
- Lati Rinpochoy et al. *Meditative States in Tibetan Buddhism: The Concentrations and Formless Absorptions*. Edited by Leah Zahler and translated by Jeffrey Hopkins. Boston: Wisdom Publications, 1997.
- Vasubandhu. *Jewels from the Treasury: Vasubandhu’s Verses on the Treasury of Abhidharma and Its Commentary, Youthful Play by the Ninth Karmapa Wangchuk Dorje*. Translated by David Karma Choephel. Woodstock, NY: KTD Publications, 2012.
- Wangchuk, Dorji. *The Resolve to Become a Buddha: A Study of the Bodhicitta Concept in Indo-Tibetan Buddhism*. Studia Philologica Buddhica Monograph Series 23. Tokyo: International Institute for Buddhist Studies, 2007.
- Zahler, Leah. *Study and Practice of Meditation: Tibetan Interpretations of the Concentrations and Formless Absorptions*. Ithaca, NY: Snow Lion Publications, 2009.

# GLOSSARY

## absorption

སྟོམས་འཇུག་ • *snyoms 'jug* • samāpatti

Sometimes rendered “meditative absorption” or “attainment.”

## actualization

དངོས་གཞི། • *dngos gzhi* • maula

Sometimes rendered “actual state.” “Actualization” here indicates the actualization of the concentration proper, as opposed to its preparatory stage (*nyer bsdogs*).

## affirming negation

མ་ཡིན་དགག་ • *ma yin dgag* • paryudāsapraṭiṣedha

Negations connected to an affirmation, such as uncontaminated primordial wisdom.

Or, a negation which, in the wake of negating the object of negation, suggests something else.

## all-ground consciousness

ཀུན་གཞི་རྣམ་ཤེས། • *kun gzhi'i rnam shes* • ālayavijñāna

The eighth consciousness from among the eight consciousnesses.

## Avṛha

མི་ཚེ་བ། • *mi che ba*

The first of the five pure abodes, also sometimes spelled Abṛha.

## Bṛhatphala

འབྲས་བུ་ཚེ་བ། འབྲས་ཚེ་བ། • *'bras bu che ba, 'bras che*

The highest heaven of the form realm.

### *Chariot of Omniscience*

རྣམ་མཁྱིན་ཤིང་རྟ། • *rnam mkhyen shing rta*

The second volume of Jigme Lingpa’s autocommentary to the *Treasury of Precious Qualities*.

### *Chariot of the Two Realities*

བདེན་གཉིས་ཤིང་རྟ། • *bden gnyis shing rta*

The first volume of Jigme Lingpa’s autocommentary to the *Treasury of Precious Qualities*.

### concentration

བསམ་གཏན། • *bsam gtan* • dhyāna

Sometimes rendered “meditative concentration.” In the context of the nine absorptions, the first four consist of the “four concentrations” (*bsam gtan bzhi*), which refer to four levels of concentration connected to the form realm.

### consummate

ཡོངས་སྤང། • *yongs grub* • pariniṣpanna

Śākya Chogden (*lung rigs kyi rol mtsho*, 134) defines the consummate as “that suchness which upon the basis of the quality-possessor—the other-dependent—is empty of the imagined” (*chos can gzhan dbang gi steng du kun tu btags pas stong pa’i de bzhin nyid de*).

### Dolpopa

དོལ་པོ་པ་ཤེས་རབ་རྒྱལ་མཚན། • *dol po pa shes rab rgyal mtshan*

Dolpopa (1292–1361) was a seminal figure in the Jonang school in Tibet and its “Other-Emptiness” interpretation of Madhyamaka.

### exalted eyes

སྤྱན་ལྔ། • *spyang lnga* • pañcacakṣuḥ

The five exalted eyes are the physical eye, the divine eye, the wisdom eye, the Dharma eye, and the eye of primordial wisdom.

### *Finding Rest in the Nature of Mind*

སེམས་ཉིད་ངལ་གསོ། • *sems nyid ngal gso*

The first volume in Longchenpa’s *Trilogy on Finding Rest* (*ngal gso skor gsum*).

### five powers

དབང་པོ་ལྔ། • *dbang po lnga* • pañcendriya

Faith, diligence, mindfulness, concentration, and wisdom.

### five pure abodes

གཙོང་གནས་ལྔ། • *gtsang gnas lnga* • pañcaśuddhāvāsakāyika

The five pure abodes are heavenly realms inhabited by noble ones (*’phags pa; ārya*) alone.

#### five strengths

སྣོབ་ས་ལྔ། • *stobs lnga* • pañcabala

Faith, diligence, mindfulness, concentration, and wisdom.

#### four applications of mindfulness

དྲན་པ་ཉེར་བཞག་བཞི། • *dran pa nyer bzbag bzhi* • catvāri smṛtyupasthānāni

The mindfulnesses applied to the body, feelings, the mind, and phenomena.

#### four causes and conditions

རྒྱ་རྒྱེན་བཞི། • *rgyu rkyen bzhi* • pratayaya

The causal condition, the immediate condition, the objective condition, and the dominant condition.

#### four foundations of supernormal ability

རྩུ་འཕུལ་གྱི་རྐང་པ་བཞི། • *rdzu 'phrul gyi rkang pa bzhi* • catvāra ṛddhipādā

Intention, diligence, attention, and discernment.

#### four right exertions

ཡང་དག་པ་སྣོན་བ་བཞི། • *yang dag pa spong ba bzhi* • catvāri samyakprahāṇāni

To avoid generating any negative states that have not arisen, to abandon negative states that have arisen, to generate virtuous states that have not arisen, and to not allow any virtuous states that have arisen to deteriorate and instead to develop them further.

#### Getse Mahāpaṇḍita Tsewang Chogdrub

དགེ་མེ་མ་རྒྱུ་ཉ་ཚེ་དབང་མཚོག་གུབ། • *dge rtse ma hA paN+di ta tshe dbang mchog grub*

Getse Mahāpaṇḍita (1761–1829) was an important Nyingma scholar of Katok Monastery and proponent of Other-Emptiness Madhyamaka.

#### Great Chariot

ཤིང་རྩ་ཚེན་པོ། • *shing rta chen po*

Longchenpa's autocommentary on *Finding Rest in the Nature of Mind*.

#### great dependent arising

རྩེན་འབྲེལ་ཚེན་པོ། • *rten 'brel chen po*

This is often referred to as the “King of Reasonings” (*rigs pa'i rgyal po*).

#### ground

ས། • *sa* • bhūmi

A level of spiritual development; the ten grounds of the bodhisattva's path are described in detail in the *Daśabbūmikasūtra*.

#### hearer

ཉན་ཐོས། • *nyan thos* • śrāvaka

The disciples of the Buddha who attended his teachings and later comprised the Śrāvakayāna, the first vehicle of Buddhism.

### imagined

ཀུན་བཏགས། • *kun btags* • parikalpita

Śākya Chogden (*lung rigs kyi rol mtsbo*, 133) defines the imagined as “that which while appearing to consciousness which, under the power of latent tendencies, appears as the duality of perceived and perceiver, is not established in accordance with that appearance.” (*bag chags kyi dbang gis gzung ’dzin gnyis su snang ba’i shes pa la snang zhing snang ba ltar ma grub pa*).

### immediately preceding condition

དེས་ཐག་པའི་རྐྱེན། • *de ma thag pa’i rkyen* • samanantarapratyaya

In Buddhist epistemology, one of the four conditions for the emergence of mind and mental events.

### Jigme Lingpa

འཇིགས་མེད་གླིང་པ། • *’jigs med gling pa*

Jigme Lingpa (1729/1730–1798) was a key tertön in the Nyingma tradition.

### Lexicon in Two Volumes

སྐྱུ་སྐྱུར་བམ་པོ་གཉིས་པ། • *sgra sbyor bam po gnyis pa*

Known as the *Madhyavyutpatti* (*bye brag tu rtogs byed ’bring po*) but also considered a commentary to the *Mahāvyutpatti* (*bye brag tu rtogs byed chen po*). Its beginning contains important guidelines for translation.

### non-affirming negation

མེད་དགག། • *med dgag* • prasajyapratishedha

A mere negation unrelated to an affirmation, such as the absence of a vase. Or, a negation which, in the wake of negating the object of negation, does not suggest something else.

### object-universal

དོན་སྤྱི། • *don spyi* • arthasāmānya

Put simply, a concept; for instance, the generic concept of a cow, rather than a real individual instance of such. Technically, the object-universal constitutes an appearing object (*snang yul*) of a conceptual cognition, but not its determined object (*zhen yul*). It is the actual object signified by language (*sgras dngos kyi brjod bya*), rather than the real entity which conceptual cognitions determine to be signified (*zhen pa’i brjod bya*). For some Tibetan scholars it encompasses the mental image inherent in conceptual cognitions. For others it is a conceptual construct distinct from the image itself, which is consciousness.

### Ornament to Clear Realization

མངོན་རྟོགས་རྒྱན། • *mngon rtogs rgyan* • *Abhisamayālaṅkāra*

One of the *Five Dharmas* of Maitreya (*byams chos sde lnga*).

*Ornament to the Mahāyāna Sūtras*

མདོ་སྤྲེལ་རྒྱུ། • *mdo sde rgyan* • *Mahāyānasūtrālamkāra*  
One of the *Five Dharmas* of Maitreya (*byams chos sde lnga*).

*Ornament to the Sugatagarbha: A Discourse Ascertaining the Approach of the Great Madhyamaka of Definitive Meaning*

ངེས་དོན་དབྱེ་མ་ཆེན་པོའི་ཚུལ་རྣམས་པར་ངེས་པའི་གཏམ་བདེ་གཤེགས་སྣོད་པོའི་རྒྱུ། • *nges don dbu ma chen po'i tshul rnam par nges pa'i gtam bde gshegs snying po'i rgyan*  
Composed by Getse Mahāpaṇḍita Tsewang Chodrub.

**other-dependent**

གཞན་དབང་། • *gzhan dbang* • paratantra  
Śākya Chogden (*lung rigs kyi rol mtsbo*, 133) defines the other-dependent as “cognitions which appear as the duality of perceived and perceiver under the power of latent tendencies, or cognitions which under the power of those appear in the form of the three realms” (*bag chags kyi dbang gis gzung 'dzin gnyis su snang ba'i rig pa zhes pa'am /de'i dbang gis khams gsum gyi rnam pa can du snang ba'i rig pa de*).

**Other-Emptiness Madhyamaka**

དབུ་མ་གཞན་སྟོང་། • *dbu ma gzhan stong*  
Famous proponents of Other-Emptiness Madhyamaka include, for instance, Dolpopa and Śākya Chogden. According to Pema Karpo (*padma dkar po*, 1527–1592), Śākya Chogden's other-emptiness position conforms to a pure False Image Cittamātra system (*sems tsam rnam rdzun lugs gtsang ma*; note that Śākya Chogden himself preferred the term Yogācāra in classifying the False Image system, reserving Cittamātra for the Real Image (*rnam bden pa*) system alone) whereas Dolpopa mixes his presentation with Tantra (Pema Karpo, *thugs rje chen po'i zlos gar*, 451).

**primordial wisdom**

ཡེ་ཤེས། • *ye shes* • jñāna  
The *bod rgya tshig mdzod chen mo* (2593–94) dictionary has: “(1) primordially present wisdom; the empty and luminous awareness which is naturally present within the mindstreams of all sentient beings (*ye nas gnas pa'i shes pa ste sems can thams cad kyi rgyud la rang bzhin gyis gnas pa'i stong gsal gyi rig pa*); (2) the exalted wisdom of a noble one (*'phags pa'i mkhyen pa*).”

**Śākya Chogden**

གསེར་མདོ་གཤེགས་ཆེན་པོའུ་མཚོ་གཤེགས་ལྷུན། • *gser mdog paN chen shAkya mchog ldan*  
Śākya Chogden (1428–1507) is considered one of the “six ornaments” of the Sakya school and is known for shifting to a public defense of Other-Emptiness Madhyamaka partway through his career as an illustrious adept and scholar. Distinctively, Śākya Chogden identifies as valid forms of Madhyamaka both Alīkākaravāda (*rnam rdzun pa*; False Image Proponents) Yogācāra, as well as the Niḥsvabhāvavāda (*ngo bo nyid med par smra ba*; Proponents of No Intrinsic

Nature) system articulated by commentators such as Bhāvaviveka (c. 500–570) and Candrakīrti (c. 570–640).

### self-realized buddha

རང་སང་རྒྱལ། • *rang sang rgyas* • pratyekabuddha

Sometimes called the “solitary realizer” is one who achieves liberation without the aid of a teacher, thus comprising the second in the series of Buddhist vehicles, the Pratyekabuddhayāna.

### seven branches of awakening

བྱང་ཚུབ་ཡན་ལག་བདུན། • *byang chub yan lag bdun* • saptabodhyaṅga

Mindfulness, discernment, effort, joy, flexibility, samādhi, and equanimity.

### three defining characteristics

མཚན་ཉིད་གསུམ། • *mtshan nyid gsum* • trilakṣaṇa

Otherwise called the “three natures” (*trisvabhāva*; *ngo bo nyid gsum* or *rang bzhin gsum*), these consist of the imagined defining characteristic (*parikalpitalakṣaṇa*; *kun btags kyi mtshan nyid*), other-dependent defining characteristic (*paratantralakṣaṇa*; *gzhan dbang*), and consummate defining characteristic (*pariniṣpannalakṣaṇa*; *yongs grub*); in a broad sense, all phenomena may be grouped under one of these three. The three defining characteristics form a core concept in Yogācāra and Other-Emptiness Madhyamaka exegesis, but presentations of the three defining characteristics can also be found in the works of Niḥsvabhāvavāda Madhyamaka authors such as Candrakīrti (c. 570–640) and Kamalaśīla (c. 740–795).

### Treasury of Precious Qualities

ཡོན་ཏན་རིན་པོ་ཆེའི་མཛོད། • *yon tan rin po che'i mdzod*

Composed by Jigme Lingpa.

### Treasury of Precious Tenet Systems

གྲུབ་པའི་མཐའི་རིན་པོ་ཆེའི་མཛོད། • *grub pa'i mtha'i rin po che'i mdzod*

One of the *Seven Treasuries* of Longchenpa (*klong chen mdzod bdun*).

### Treasury of Precious Wish-Fulfilling Jewels

ཡིད་བཞིན་རིན་པོ་ཆེའི་མཛོད། • *yid bzhin rin po che'i mdzod*

One of the *Seven Treasuries* of Longchenpa (*klong chen mdzod bdun*).

### vajra splinters

རྡོ་རྗེ་གཟེགས་མ། • *rdo rje gzegs ma*

A type of Madhyamaka reasoning used to examine causality.

### White Lotus

བདམ་དཀར་པོ། • *padma dkar po*

Longchenpa's autocommentary on the *Treasury of Precious Wish-Fulfilling Jewels*.

**wisdom**

ཤེས་རབ། • *shes rab* • *prajñā*

Discriminative wisdom; this may be further divided into the discriminative wisdom born from learning that is based on scripture, the discriminative wisdom born from reflection that is based on reasoning, and the discriminative wisdom born from meditation that is based on experience.